How it appeared?
Facts
Interpretations
Values
Many evidences
Policy Analytics

What is evident in evidence based policy making?

Alexis Tsoukiàs

LAMSADE - CNRS, Université Paris-Dauphine
tsoukias@lamsade.dauphine.fr

Paris, 02/12/2010

How it appeared?
Facts
Interpretations
Values
Many evidences
Policy Analytics

Outline

1. How it appeared?

2. Facts

3. Interpretations

4. Values

5. Many evidences

6. Policy Analytics

How it appeared?
Facts
Interpretations
Values
Many evidences
Policy Analytics

Where does it come from?

1. UK government
   see for instance
   http://www.policyhub.gov.uk/docs/modgov.pdf or
   http://www.odi.org.uk/rapid/Bibliographies/EBP/bibliography.html

2. US government
   see for instance http://coalition4evidence.org or
   http://www.urban.org/uploadedPDF/900636_EvidenceBasedPolic

3. Statistics, Data Analysis, Data Mining etc...

How it appeared?
Facts
Interpretations
Values
Many evidences
Policy Analytics

A legitimation issue

Policy makers feel lacking legitimation in their policy making process.

- Mistrust between public opinion, experts and policy makers.
- Information society and information circulation and availability.
- Social fragmentation.
- Short agendas vs. long term concerns.

How it appeared?
Facts
Interpretations
Values
Many evidences
Policy Analytics

Did the air quality improved?

pollutant	CO_2	SO_2	O_3	dust
t_1	3	3	8	8
t_2	3	3	8	2

How it appeared?
Facts
Interpretations
Values
Many evidences
Policy Analytics

Did the air quality improved?

pollutant	CO_2	SO_2	O_3	dust
t_1	3	3	8	8
t_2	3	3	8	2

The air quality improved, but for the ATMO index did not. Who tells the truth?

How it appeared?
Facts
Interpretations
Values
Many evidences
Policy Analytics

Meaningfulness

Theoretical Soundness

Information needs to be manipulated in a coherent and consistent way (measurement theory).

Operational Completeness

Information needs to be manipulated in order to be useful for who is using it and for those purposes for which has been designed. It should allow to reach a conclusion.

How it appeared?
Facts
Interpretations
Values
Many evidences
Policy Analytics

What does it mean?

95% of rural households in Burkina Faso do not have tap water available

- For us this is a serious problem and evidence of poverty, but for the locals is not.
- For the local men this is not a problem, while it is for the local women.

How it appeared?
Facts
Interpretations
Values
Many evidences
Policy Analytics

Differences of perspective

- Different standards and thresholds.
- Different cultures.
- Different stakeholders.
- Different concerns.
- Different resources.

How it appeared?
Facts
Interpretations
Values
Many evidences
Policy Analytics

Is it good or bad?

The h-index of X is 19. Is (s)he a good researcher?

- Who is a good researcher?
- What good research means?
- Who decides and for what purpose about research quality?

How it appeared?
Facts
Interpretations
Values
Many evidences
Policy Analytics

Values

What do we take into account?

- Values and preferences of relevant stakeholders.
- Individual values and social values.
- Judgements (experts, politicians, opinions).

How it appeared?
Facts
Interpretations
Values
Many evidences
Policy Analytics

Who is the winner?

> 10 voters have preferences *aPbPc*,
> 6 voters have preferences *bPcPa*
> and 5 voters have preferences *cPbPa*.

.

How it appeared?
Facts
Interpretations
Values
Many evidences
Policy Analytics

Who is the winner?

10 voters have preferences   *aPbPc*,
6 voters have preferences   *bPcPa*
and 5 voters have preferences   *cPbPa*.

Most electoral systems will choose *a*, which is the one the majority does not want. Actually the Condorcet winner is *b*.

How it appeared?
Facts
Interpretations
Values
Many evidences
Policy Analytics

Different ways to construct evidence

- Different ways to establish a majority.
- Different ways to compute an average.
- Different ways to take into account the importance of ...
- Positive and Negative reasons/arguments.

How it appeared?
Facts
Interpretations
Values
Many evidences
Policy Analytics

1st Claim

Constructing evidence is a decision aiding process.

- Who needs this evidence?
- Why (s)he needs this evidence? What is the purpose?
- Who other is affected by such evidence and how?
- What resources do we commit and what do we expect?

How it appeared?
Facts
Interpretations
Values
Many evidences
Policy Analytics

2nd Claim

Constructing evidence is a field of scientific investigation.

- Measurement Theory.
- Decision Analysis.
- Social Choice Theory.
- Computer Science and Artificial Intelligence.
- Political Sciences and Economy.

How it appeared?
Facts
Interpretations
Values
Many evidences
Policy Analytics

3rd Claim

Challenges in constructing evidence.

- Participatory decision making processes.
- Making sense out of huge amounts of information.
- Taking into account heterogenous sources and interpretations.
- Shared, consensual and legitimate evidence.

How it appeared?
Facts
Interpretations
Values
Many evidences
Policy Analytics

Policy Analytics

- Analytics for policy making.
- Accountability and legitimation.
- Argumentation and consensus.
- Constructive learning